# The Cloning Debate at the United Nations







David A. Prentice, Ph.D.

#### Uses of Cloning (Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer-SCNT) Remove Remove Remove Remove skin cell udder cell DNA from DNA from from from unfertilized unfertilized patient white-face sheep egg egg Fuse cells Fuse cells Cloning completed Early embryo Clone formed Early embryo with with donor DNA donor DNA Cloned Cloned embryo embryo Dolly Implant in surrogate

Infant clone

of patient

Embryonic

stem cells

"Reproductive cloning" "Therapeutic cloning"

Clone of

white-face sheep

"Reproductive cloning" "Therapeutic cloning"

Implant

in surrogate

Embryonic

stem cells

## Timeline of Cloning Debate at the U.N.

- •2001 Germany and France propose resolution to ban reproductive cloning of humans.
- U.N. General Assembly forms Ad Hoc Committee to consider issue, as a Working Group of the Sixth Committee (International Law).
- •2002 Working Group meetings & initial report; Sixth Committee continued discussion for next session.
- •2003 29 September-3 October—Working group meetings & report. 20-21 October—Debate in 6<sup>th</sup> Committee (2 resolutions proposed) 6 November—Vote to delay consideration for 2 years (until 2005) proposed by Iran on behalf of OIC; passed 80-79-15 (17 absent) 9 December—Agreement in General Assembly to delay for one year, and reconsider in 2004

# www.un.org/law/cloning

## Resolution texts related to banning human cloning

### L.2— Costa Rica with 66 Co-Sponsors:

Any person commits an offence within the meaning of this Convention if that person intentionally engages in an action, such as somatic cell nuclear transfer or embryo-splitting, resulting in the creation of a living organism, at any stage of physical development, that is genetically virtually identical to an existing or previously existing human organism.

### L.8—Belgium with 23 Co-Sponsors:

(a) An obligation on all contracting parties to ban reproductive cloning of human beings with no possibility of making any reservations;(b) An obligation on all contracting parties to take action to control other forms of human cloning by adopting a ban or imposing a moratorium or regulating them by means of national legislation

L.2—66 Co-Sponsors: Albania, Angola, Antigua and Barbuda, Benin, Burundi, Central African Republic, Chad, Chile, Congo, Democratic Rep. of, Costa Rica, Côte d'Ivoire, Dominica, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, El Salvador, Equatorial Guinea, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Fiji, Gambia, Georgia, Grenada, Guinea, Guyana, Haiti, Honduras, Ireland, Italy, Kazakhstan, Kenya, Kyrgyzstan, Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Marshall Islands, Micronesia, Nauru, Nicaragua, Nigeria, Norway, Palau, Papua New Guinea, Panama, Paraguay, Philippines, Portugal, Rwanda, Saint Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, Saint Vincent/Grenadines, San Marino, Sao Tome and Principe Sierra Leone, Solomon Islands, Spain, Suriname, Tajikistan, Tanzania, Timor-Leste, Turkmenistan, Tuvalu, Uganda, United States, Uzbekistan, Vanuatu, Zambia

**L.8—23 Co-Sponsors**: Belarus, <u>Belgium</u>, Brazil, China, Cuba, the Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, Greece, Iceland, Japan, Latvia, Liechtenstein, Lithuania, the Republic of Korea, Singapore, Slovenia, South Africa, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, United Kingdom.

#### **Vote to postpone for 2 years: 80-79-15 (17 absent)**

In favour: Algeria, Argentina, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bahamas, Bahrain, Belarus, Belgium, Botswana, Brazil, Brunei Darussalam, Bulgaria, Cambodia, China, Comoros, Croatia, Cuba, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Democratic People's Republic of Korea, Denmark, Djibouti, Egypt, Estonia, Finland, France, Gabon, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, India, Indonesia, Iran, Japan, Jordan, Kuwait, Latvia, Lebanon, Liechtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malaysia, Maldives, Mali, Mauritania, Mauritius, Mexico, Monaco, Morocco, Myanmar, Namibia, Netherlands, New Zealand, Niger, Oman, Pakistan, Qatar, Republic of Korea, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, Singapore, Slovenia, South Africa, Sri Lanka, Sudan, Swaziland, Sweden, Switzerland, Syria, Thailand, Tonga, Tunisia, Turkey, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom, Viet Nam, Yemen, Zimbabwe.

Against: Albania, Andorra, Angola, Antigua and Barbuda, Australia, Austria, Barbados, Belize, Bolivia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Burundi, Central African Republic, Chile, Costa Rica, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Dominica, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, El Salvador, Equatorial Guinea, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Federated States of Micronesia, Fiji, Gambia, Georgia, Grenada, Guatemala, Guinea, Guyana, Haiti, Honduras, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Kazakhstan, Kenya, Kyrgyzstan, Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Malta, Marshall Islands, Nauru, Nepal, Nicaragua, Nigeria, Norway, Palau, Panama, Papua New Guinea, Paraguay, Philippines, Poland, Portugal, Rwanda, Saint Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, Samoa, San Marino, Sao Tome and Principe, Sierra Leone, Slovakia, Solomon Islands, Somalia, Spain, Suriname, Tajikistan, Timor-Leste, Trinidad and Tobago, Tuvalu, Uganda, United Republic of Tanzania, United States, Uzbekistan, Vanuatu, Venezuela, Zambia

<u>Abstaining</u>: Bangladesh, Bhutan, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Canada, Cape Verde, Colombia, Jamaica, Peru, Republic of Moldova, Romania, Serbia and Montenegro, The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Ukraine, Uruguay.

<u>Absent</u>: Afghanistan, Benin, Chad, Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Guinea-Bissau, Iraq, Kiribati, Lao People's Democratic Republic, Liberia, Libya, Mongolia, Mozambique, Seychelles, Togo, Turkmenistan.